

APRIL 29, 2016  
THIMPHU THROMDE  
Gongzin Lam

# 2ND THROMDE TSHOGDE MINUTES

2ND THROMDE COUNCIL



## Table of Contents

Abbreviation	3
Definition	4
2nd <i>Thromde Tshogde</i> of 2nd <i>Thromde</i> Council	5
Date:	5
Venue:	5
Time:	5
Members Present	5
Invitees	5
Opening Remarks	6
Follow up on 1st <i>Tshogde</i>	6
Agenda 1. LG Act to be followed	7
Agenda 2. Election of Deputy Chairperson of <i>Thromde</i>	8
Agenda 3. The staffs of Thimphu <i>Thromde</i> to be in office during office hours	8
Agenda 4. All Division/Section Heads must attend <i>Thromde Tshogde</i>	9
Agenda 5. Extension of City Bus services	9
Agenda 6. Time extension for the workers in Taba-Dechencholing areas	10
Agenda 7. Proposal for archery ground, open Gym and Children park in Jungzhina and Hejo-Samtenling LAP.	10
Agenda 8. Proper planning and roads for E4 areas in Semtokha- An appeal by E4 land owners	11
Agenda 9. The need for zebra crossings in every 50 meters along express way and Local bus service to all planned service roads along with few bus stops and proper timing	11
Agenda 10. ID card for <i>Tsangdra Thuemi</i>	12
Agenda 11. The need for park and taxi parking in Motithang	12
Agenda 12. The need for access road for 6 HHs in Changangkha area	13
Agenda 13. Retirement benefits - Mr. Dorji Dukpa (Ex lajab of TT)	13
Agenda 14. Auctioning of old machineries and equipment	14
Agenda 15. Repairing of Electric Cars	15
Agenda 16. Request for the payment of betterment charges along with house loan	15
Agenda 17. Request for the permission for loading and unloading	15

---

Agenda 18. Conversion of E2 to E4 in Kawang	16
Agenda 19. Request for waiving off of late fee penalty.	16
Agenda 20. Endorsement of additional budget for Low income housing	17
Agenda 21. Approval for honorarium for VP of MHSS	17
Agenda 22. Study tour for Gold medalist	18
Agenda 23. Final payment to Thai-Company for crematorium	18
Agenda 24. Outstanding suits against the advances of <i>Chorten</i> renovations	19
Agenda 25. Parking related issues	19
Agenda 26. Delegating cleaning service to youth social service group	20
Agenda 27. Report on list of issues	22
Agenda 28. Waste to Energy Project – BIOGAS	22
Agenda 29. Chadri payments made from <i>Thromde</i> revenue	23
Agenda 30. Dog Management within <i>Thromde</i>	23
Agenda 31. Crematorium Management	24
Agenda 32. Population and Hosing Census of Bhutan (PHCB)	24
AOB	24
1) North Thimphu waste outsourcing	24
Conclusion	25
Minute Keeper	25

## Abbreviation

AFD – Administration and Finance Division  
BOC – Bhutan Olympic Committee  
BPC – Bhutan Power Corporation  
CNG – Compressed Natural Gas  
Corp. – Corporation  
DCFO – Deputy Chief Finance Officer  
DoC – Department of Culture  
E2 and E4 – Environment Precincts  
ECB – Election Commission of Bhutan  
FY – Fiscal Year  
FYP – Five Year Plan  
G2C – Government to Citizen  
GoI – Government of India  
HHs/HH – Households/His Holiness  
HRC – Human Resource Committee  
ID – Identity Card  
KCR – Private Company (Parking Fee Collection Company)  
KMs – Kilometers  
LAP – Local Area Plan  
LG – Local Government  
LPG – Liquefied Petroleum Gas  
M – Million  
M/D/P – per Meter per Day per Person  
MoEA – Ministry of Economic Affairs  
MoF – Ministry of Finance  
MoFA – Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
MoH – Ministry of Health  
MoWHS – Ministry of Works and Human Settlement  
MTR – Mid Term Review  
Nu. – Ngultrum  
Offtg. Officiating  
RBP – Royal Bhutan Police  
SDP – Small Development Project  
TEO – *Thromde* Education Officer  
ToR – Terms of Reference  
UPD – Urban Planning Division  
YDF – Youth Development Fund  
YSS – Youth Social Service

### Definition

Chadri – Grand preparation

Chorten – Religious Stupa

Druk Gyalpo – His Majesty the King of Bhutan

Kuensel – Print Media

Lajab – Labor Supervisor

Ngultrum – Bhutanese Currency

Thram – land Ownership Certificate

Thromde - Municipality

Thrompon – Mayor

*Thuemi*– Representative

*Tsangdra Tshogpa*– A community based committee for cleanliness

*Tshogde* – Council

Zhungdratshang – Central Monastic Body

*2nd Thromde Tshogde of 2nd Thromde Council*

Date: 29th May 2016

Venue: Conference Hall 1, MoWHS

Time: 9:00AM - 6:00PM

**Members Present**

1	Dasho Kinlay Dorjee	Thrompon	Chairperson
2	Mr. Pasang Dorji	Executive Secretary	Member Secretary
3	Mr. Namgay Tshering	Member	Babesa <i>Thuemi</i>
4	Mrs. Phub Dem	Member	Olakha <i>Thuemi</i>
5	Mr. Kuenga Yonten	Member	Norzin <i>Thuemi</i>
6	Mr. Rinzin Dorji	Member	Changangkha <i>Thuemi</i>
7	Mrs. Dorji Dema	Member	Motithang <i>Thuemi</i>
8	Mr. Ugyen Penjore	Member	Jungzhina <i>Thuemi</i>
9	Mr. Ugyen	Member	Taba-Dechencholing <i>Thuemi</i>

**Invitees**

1	Mr. Geley Norbu	Chief, UPD
2	Mr. Palden Khandu	Chief, DCD
3	Mr. Hastabahadur Sangpang	Chief ADM
4	Mr. Tshering Peljore	Chief, Env. Div
5	Mr. Pekar Rabgay	Offgt. Chief, Eng. Div
6	Mr. Nakphel	Head, Water Section
7	Mr. Sangay Wangdi	Head, Road Section
8	Mr. Dorji Wangchuk	TEO
9	Mr. Sonam Nima	DCFO
10	Mr. Ugyen Tshechu Dorji	Legal Officer
11	Mr. Sonam Dhendup	Census Officer
12	Mr. Yesy Wangdi	Env. Div
13	Mr. Sonam Namgay	Engineer
14	Mr. Karma Dorji	Planning Officer
15	Media Personnel	Kuensel Corp.

## Opening Remarks

The Chairperson welcomed all the members and the officials of Thimphu *Thromde* for the 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde Tshogde*. He also informed the council on some of the achievements made in the past two months since the convention of the 1<sup>st</sup> *Tshogde* of the 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde* Council Members. The Lubding water supply which was constructed under SDP I, GoI funding has been completed and was inaugurated on 20<sup>th</sup> April 2016 in presence of all beneficiaries. Also the Chairperson informed about the completion of the bridges in Dechencholing and Hejo which are also under the SDP funding of GoI. He also highlighted some of the severe water problems that Thimphu *Thromde* is facing at this summer time of the year. The problems are being solved with supply of water in bulk with the help RBP fire fighter trucks. He informed that *Thromde* is looking at every possibility in solving the problems. He on behalf of *Tshogde* and *Thromde* extended the gratitude to RBP for rendering such help as always.

The Chairperson also thanked the *Thuemis* and the people of *Thromde* for rendering every support for *Thromde*. He explained the need for community participation and support in every field like maintenance of cleanliness, monitoring of service infrastructures and others in the coming years as well. *Thromde* will also work towards enhancing community vitality. The Chairperson also urged all *Thuemis* to work with common intention and goals in fulfilling the duties and responsibilities as *Thromde Thuemis*. He also reminded the roles of *Thuemis* in informing the public regarding the 11<sup>th</sup> FYP MTR of Thimphu *Thromde* which was scheduled a day after the *Tshogde*.

## Follow up on 1st *Tshogde*

The 1<sup>st</sup> *Tshogde* was convened on 26<sup>th</sup> February 2016. Most of the decisions made were implemented but few could not be taken up due to some issues.

**1. Online Education System:** The TEO explained the background of the system and the benefits of having the system in place. Since the introduction of such system early this year, it has eased the admission procedures without parents and students having to visit *Thromde* Education Office and wait in long queue for very long time. Regarding the recent visit of the Malaysian experts to enhance the existing system, the 1<sup>st</sup> *Tshogde* has decided to bear all the expenses by *Thromde*. Therefore, the expenses for the same have come to about 0.146M which the Finance Section has objected based on the non-availability of all the required documents. However, the 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde Tshogde* based on the significance of such system, decided that the payment of about 0.146M will have to be made from *Thromde's* revenue.

**Action:** DCFO

**2. Babesa *Chorten* re-construction works:** The re-construction has been approved by 1<sup>st</sup> *Tshogde* however it could not be processed since the *Thuemi* concerned was not clear on the budget availability. It was decided that the approval will have to be sought form DoC and the

reconstruction works will have to be carried. Regarding the budget, the 2<sup>nd</sup> *Tshogde* decided that some amount from interested people willing to make contributions shall be mobilized and rest will be covered by *Thromde's* Budget. Babesa *Thuemi* to take a lead in mobilizing the fund from those willing and interested people.

**Action:** Babesa *Thuemi* and DCFO

**3. Temple near Clock Tower to be handed over to *Zhungdratshang*:** The decision of the 1<sup>st</sup> *Tshogde* was to hand over the temple to *Zhungdratshang* and the Norzin *Thuemi* to follow up on this with relevant officials of *Thromde*. However, it could not be processed since the concerned *Thuemi* could not get the clear idea on whom to follow up the decision with. 2<sup>nd</sup> *Tshogde* decided that an agreement with *Zhungdratshang* will have to be drawn and meanwhile a month long notice will be given to the people currently residing in the temple to vacate and this will have to be initiated by Norzin *Thuemi*.

**Action:** Norzin *Thuemi* and Executive Secretary

**4. *Tshogde* Minutes translation:** It was decided in 1<sup>st</sup> *Thromde Tshogde* that in place of translating the minutes, *Thuemis* will be given the opportunities to learn English. However, the same issue in 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde Tshogde* was discussed and agreed that the translation of the minutes will be outsourced until Ms. Tshering Pem resumes her office. The minutes of only the 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde* council will be translated. If the minutes are to be translated, English classes for *Thuemis* will not be provided.

**Action:** Planning Officer

### Agenda 1. LG Act to be followed

The issue was raised by all *Thuemis* on the need to follow the LG Act strictly by all *Thromde* staffs.

#### Discussion

The main issue was regarding the non-involvement of *Thuemis* in planning, development and monitoring activities of all the activities being carried out by *Thromde*. The *Thuemis* requested the *Thromde* management to include all *Thuemis* in all developmental activities that are being carried since they are answerable to the public on what is happening in their constituencies.

#### Decision

The *Tshogde* decided that all relevant *Thuemis* will be involved in planning, monitoring and development of planned activities. Any information regarding the budget, tendering, award of works and monitoring will be shared and make sure that the relevant *Thuemis* are involved. Clear boundaries of Constituencies will be carried out and will be handed over to *Thuemis* and they are required to take initiative in boundary identifications. A mail box will be installed in *Thuemi's*

office and issue an office order that all *Tshogde* decisions will have to be taken up or implemented as decided.

**Action:** All relevant officials, UPD and Executive Secretary

## Agenda 2. Election of Deputy Chairperson of *Thromde*

The *Thuemis* have raised the issue since *Tshogde* deputy chairperson has not been elected as per the LG Act of Bhutan.

### Discussion

According to LG Act 2009 of Bhutan, deputy chairperson among the *Thuemis* will have to be elected during the first session of the *Tshogde* after the election. Since the election could not be done, the *Thuemis* questioned the floor on how to go about. The Chairperson informed that the deputy chairperson could not be elected since *Thromde Thuemi* has been elected in addition to existing *Thuemis* and still no clear directives about his/her roles have been received. He even raised that if the directives from higher authorities' states that *Thromde Thuemi* elected will be a Deputy Chairperson, there will be two Deputy Chairperson. Many members were of the view that since there are no clear directives, it should be abided by the LG Act 2009.

### Decision

*Tshogde* decided that the Deputy Chairperson will be elected during the 3rd Sitting of *Thromde Tshogde* and *Thromde* will have to write to ECB for technical backstopping on the day of election.

**Action:** Planning Officer

## Agenda 3. The staffs of Thimphu *Thromde* to be in office during office hours

The issue was also raised by *Thuemis* which was raised by the public during their community meetings. Public complaint that they are facing difficulty in meeting with the required officials of *Thromde* and hence are required to visit many times just for a single signature or remarks. On behalf of the public, the *Thuemis* have requested the officials of Thimphu *Thromde* to be in office for the benefits of the public.

### Discussion

The *Thuemis* explained that the statement doesn't mean to say that the *Thromde* officials are not doing their job by not being in the office. It is clearly understandable that the officials will have to attend meetings, attend site visits and other field works, during which the concerned officials will not be available in the office. However, it is a public grievance and is put up to *Tshogde* for deliberations. The member secretary informed the council that with the introduction of G2C services in *Thromde* now, people will have to use it and get the service delivered without having to

visit *Thromde* offices or meet with the *Thromde* officials. The Chairperson also added that G2C services have been launched and have to be utilized by the people. Many such services will be included in the G2C portal in near future.

### **Decision**

The *Tshogde* decided that the HRC should relook and revisit the job allocations of the *Thromde* officials and also *Thromde* Management to enhance the G2C services to cater larger number of public/clients.

**Action:** HRC and G2C focal person

### **Agenda 4. All Division/Section Heads must attend *Thromde Tshogde***

It was also put up by *Thuemis*, the need for all relevant officials of *Thromde* to attend the *Tshogde* for effective discussions.

### **Discussion**

Since all kinds of issues are being discussed in *Tshogde*, it is important to have all Division and Section Heads attending the session. *Thuemis* requested all relevant officials to attend the *Tshogde* besides Division and Section Heads. The members felt that the presence of relevant officials help to make a right decision based on the facts and figures. They also felt that all Division and Section Heads must be aware of the decisions being passed by the *Tshogde*.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided that all Division and Section Heads will have to be present in *Tshogde* henceforth. The Executive Secretary to issue an office order regarding the same. Also decided that the agenda will have to be reviewed by Executive Secretary before it is being submitted to *Tshogde* for deliberations.

**Action:** Executive Secretary

### **Agenda 5. Extension of City Bus services**

During the community meeting, the people of Dechencholing Dangrey requested *Thromde* for extension of the City bus services to their places which currently is little away from the city bus stop.

### **Discussion**

Most of the members said that since the operation of City buses are looked after by Bhutan post, *Thromde* can only make a request to them and it is up to the Bhutan Post whether the service extension is feasible or not.

Action: Dechencholing *Thuemi*

### Agenda 6. Time extension for the workers in Taba-Dechencholing areas

As the contract term for the workers involved in cleaning the Taba-Dechencholing areas is over, the Taba-Dechencholing *Thuemi* requested the *Tshogde* for time extension of the laborers.

#### Discussion

The members appreciated the works done by the laborers in maintaining the areas clean. The same initiative could be replicated in other constituencies as well coordinated by respective *Thuemis*.

#### Decision

The *Tshogde* decided to review MoU and extend the period based on the performance of the laborers/workers.

**Action:** *Thuemi* and the concerned Engineer

### Agenda 7. Proposal for archery ground, open Gym and Children Park in Jungzhina and Hejo-Samtenling LAP.

This was the request made by the public during the public meeting. It was put up by Jungzhina *Thuemi*. He informed *Tshogde* that there are spaces available for the development of such facilities in the areas along the river bank and as well as in Babena areas.

#### Discussion

The Chairperson welcomed the proposal and informed the floor that such proposals from the public will have to be looked at and consider by *Thromde*. He informed that the works on establishment of archery grounds is going on in collaboration with BOC and has already identified 18 such sites where archery ground is found to be feasible, and this also include the Jungzhina area. Regarding the open gym facilities, *Thromde* in collaboration with MoH will have to look for funds to establish such facilities. The Environment Division informed that the first phase of installing open gym facilities has been completed and there will be 2nd phase to complete those areas which are not covered by the first phase. Even the members felt the need to have parks in the areas since there are available spaces. The member secretary informed the floor that, *Thromde* has received an application from HH Garab Rinpoche expressing the interest to open a park in Thimphu, so probably Jungzhina could be the site.

#### Decision

*Tshogde* appreciated and approved the proposals and agreed to work on it. Archery ground feasibility will be studied in collaboration with BOC. Open gym facilities will be established in the

2nd phase in collaboration with the MoH. The park development is approved and will be allowed if private individuals or entity are interested in supporting the development of parks.

**Action:** Environment Division to follow up with BOC and MoH and other relevant organizations

### Agenda 8. Proper planning and roads for E4 areas in Semtokha- An appeal by E4 land owners

The issue was brought up by Babesa *Thuemi* regarding the absence of any plans for E4 areas despite repeated request to *Thromde* for development. They have been paying the revised urban taxes and are hopeful for the proper planning and other services to be in place.

#### Discussion

The chairperson informed that E4 areas are not neglected. *Thromde* already have a plan to carry out the plan for the E4 areas and it will have to be started with a topographical survey and slope analysis. The UPD informed that the plan is essential in E4 areas but due to shortage of man power especially in Planning Division, the works had to be carried out on a priority basis. However, the planning for E4 areas is important. The road section also informed the floors that now it's high time that *Thromde* initiate a plan for E4 areas.

#### Decision

The planning for E4 areas will be contracted out this year if there is a budget balance of the current FY.

**Action:** Babesa *Thuemi* and UPD

### Agenda 9. The need for zebra crossings in every 50 meters along express way and Local bus service to all planned service roads along with few bus stops and proper timing

The concern for having zebra crossings in every 50 meters along express way was raised by Babesa *Thuemi*. This is because people have to travel for long distances to cross through a zebra crossing which are far apart and it is very difficult for them to catch a cab or city bus on time. Therefore, people have requested to have zebra crossings in every 50 meters so that people need not travel long to cross the road.

#### Discussion

Many members were of the view that the current numbers of zebra crossings are good enough to serve the purpose or even more. If there are more zebra crossings, it will create more traffic congestions. Hence, some other alternatives will have to be looked at to solve the problem of the people. There are possibilities of taking the bus stop and taxi stops into the internal roads. There are

also plan to establish a separate transport office by the government and hopefully the matter will be taken care of. However, the Bhutan Post City bus services will have to extend into the internal roads to minimize the people crossing over the express way to catch city bus services.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided to make a joint site visit with Bhutan Post and identify some sites for the establishment of City bus stops and taxi stops in the internal roads rather than having only along the express way. The request for pedestrian passing or zebra crossings in every 50 meters was not approved.

**Action:** Road Section, Engineering Division & Babesa *Thuemi*

### **Agenda 10. ID card for *Tsangdra Thuemi***

This was brought up by Motithang *Thuemi* after having formed a committee in her constituency. She informed the floor that the committee will be responsible for all matter related to the constituency. Therefore, to recognize them by the public, each of them should be given an ID by *Thromde*.

### **Discussion**

The members discussed on the need to have ID card for all the committee that will be formed in all constituencies. Not only in Motithang, even the committee formed in all other constituencies shall be given a ID card each for the public to easily approach the committee for any matter concerning the constituency. Likewise, all other constituency will have to form a committee of 4-5 members and the list to be submitted to *Thromde* office and *Thromde* will conduct a meeting with these committees to discuss all issues and their ToR. If people are reluctant to volunteer to form a committee, *Thromde* cannot go on forcing and those constituencies with the committee formed shall submit the list.

### **Decision**

The *Tshogde* decided that all *Thuemis* will have to form a committee purely on a voluntary basis and the list to be submitted to *Thromde* office. After having the complete list, *Thromde* will conduct a meeting with these committees and brief them on their duties and responsibilities. Once all the list and required details are submitted, ID card will be issued.

**Action:** All *Thuemis*

### **Agenda 11. The need for park and taxi parking in Motithang**

The people of the Motithang constituency has requested for additional park for the people to hang out during leisure times and also for the elderly people to spend their time. The current park is

small and can't cater to a large number of users there. Therefore, the issue was brought up to the *Tshogde* by Motithang *Thuemi* for deliberation. Also the *Thuemi* pointed out the need to have few taxi parking spaces in the area for the benefit of the public.

### **Discussion**

The chairperson informed that such proposals are good and *Thromde* will have to look for the possibilities. He also informed that one space is near 3 tank areas but the space used by cattle house and garage will have to be relocated. The waste trucks parked in the area will have to be removed by the Greener Way and the North Thimphu waste collection contractor. The cattle house will have to be relocated. One such shed for cattle will have to be established in North and one in South. Once the area has been cleared, it can be developed as park. The other space is above Sangaygang where the space has been cleared which can be used as park. The other space is below Ministers enclave where there are labor camps. Once the labor camps are shifted, the area can be developed into park.

Regarding the requirement of taxi parking in Motithang area, the members felt that the parking is not required. Taxis within Thromde areas have enough dedicated lanes. No more parking spaces can be dedicated for taxis as Thromde is now gearing towards collection of parking fees in all over Thromde areas.

### **Decision**

The park near 3-tank area will be developed by next FY. One cattle shed will have to be established in North, Dechencholing and South, Babesa. Taxi parking not approved for Motithang areas,

**Action:** Environment Division and concerned *Thuemis*

### **Agenda 12. The need for access road for 6 HHs in Changangkha area**

The request was made by the 6 HHs who requested for the access road. The area near Changangkha temple.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided to construct the access road in the FY 2016-2017 since the road is essential for the benefit of the public.

**Action:** Road Section and *Thuemi* concerned

### **Agenda 13. Retirement benefits - Mr. Dorji Dukpa (Ex lajab of TT)**

The 1st *Tshogde* has decided to give 6 months' salary as a retirement benefits as they have requested. However, Mr. Dorji Dukpa did not take the benefits as decided and appealed *Thromde* office to pay him the retirement benefits as per the Labor and Employment Act. He has submitted

that he has serve for 25 years in *Thromde* and as per the Act, he is entitled for more. He has also submitted the letter of concern signed by the ex-labor officer whom the *Tshogde* could not consider since the labor officer was for the years 1979 to 1996 and is now a retired officer.

### Discussion

All members were of the view that *Thromde* or *Tshogde* can't validate that he has worked for 25 years in *Thromde* in absence of service order or appointment order. The letter of concern that he submitted could not be considered by *Tshogde* as it is given by the ex-labor officer who was in service as labor officer in 1980s. Moreover, the letter has been written in a plain paper without any letter heads.

### Decision

The *Tshogde* did not approve the payment of gratuity as requested on the ground that there is no proper documentation proving his service of more than 10 years in *Thromde*.

**Action:** AFD

### Agenda 14. Auctioning of old machineries and equipment

The AFD has presented to the *Tshogde*, some of the old machineries and equipment for approval for auctioning. The *Tshogde* based on the condition of the machinery list, decided the following.

List of Properties to be Auctioned							
Lot No.	Registration No.	Type of Property	Model	Original Price (Nu.)	Reserve Price	Tshogde revised Price (Nu)	Tshogde's Decision
		Vehicles					
1	BG-1-0350	Back Hoe Loader	2001	2043348	71896		Not Approved
2	BG-1-0398	Excavator	2003	2129352	117064	300,000.00	Approved
3	BG-1-A1388	Kubota Tractor	2007	271003	36271	50,000.00	Approved
4	BG-1-0397	Eicher Dumper Placer	2003	749002	41179		Not Approved
5	BG-1-A2134	Thunder Electric Car	2012	600000	245760		Not Approved
6	BG-1-0618	Scooter	2004	32354	2225	2,225.00	Approved

Those machineries which are not approved for auctioning will have to be repaired and used again. Besides the above machineries, *Tshogde* also approved the list of office furniture and equipment as presented by AFD. *Tshogde* also approved and ordered to form a committee consisting of Jungzhina *Thuemi*, Environment Head and Internal Auditor and make a list of things to be auctioned and auction along with the existing auction lists. The old scrapes in crematorium and in and around *Thromde* including old streetlight posts and accessories will have to be listed and auction together with the above list. The Electrical section and the Environment Division to help in preparing the list to be auctioned.

**Action:** Committee formed, Environment Division and Electrical Section

### Agenda 15. Repairing of Electric Cars

The AFD has proposed for the repair of 2 electric cars which were procured in 2012 and have run over 35,000 Kms. The cars have not been repaired even once till date. The total cost for repair is Nu. 170280.

### **Discussion**

The members felt the need to repair electric cars but the cost of repairing is very high. The AFD informed that if the cars are repaired, it can be used for next five years.

### **Decision**

The *Tshogde* decided that the cars need to be repaired, however cheaper options will have to be explored. The current cost is very high.

**Action:** MTO & AFD

### **Agenda 16. Request for the payment of betterment charges along with house loan**

The request was put up by Mr. Toeba. He has plot size of 20 decimals, Thram No. 264. He was entitled for betterment charges of Nu. 412,000 which he requested to pay along with house loan on a monthly basis as he has got so many challenges in life and can't pay at once.

### **Discussion**

The members informed that *Tshogde* should not go on solving an individual case; the decision made in *Tshogde* should serve the general purposes. If we solve the individual case like this one, there will be many such cases in future. Some members also shared that such case to be looked on genuine basis because there are people in *Thromde* which requires *Thromde's* support in such cases.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* did not approve the request. The payment will have to be made at once and no such precedence will be set in *Thromde*.

**Action:** SLMS

### **Agenda 17. Request for the permission for loading and unloading**

The request was made by Rigsum Institute located near City bus stops. The hardware shop has been facing problem in loading and unloading their products since it is located in the heart of town with no proper loading and unloading spaces available. They have been facing problem with traffic flow at the time of loading and unloading. Therefore, they have requested *Thromde* to provide them with dedicate lane for loading and unloading purposes or to divert the traffic at times of loading and unloading.

**Discussion**

The members felt the location is at the heart of the town and there is no way a dedicated lane can be provided by removing parking spaces nor can't traffic be diverted. The traffic is busy in the location and such possibilities are out of question. Even if *Thromde* provide such luxury, there will be lot of problems from other users of the road.

**Decision**

The request was not approved since the traffic flow and traffic congestion will be a problem if it is considered.

**Action:** Road section

**Agenda 18. Conversion of E2 to E4 in Kawang**

The area is located in Kawang, Thram No. 512 owned jointly by Ms Rinzin Lhamu and Jamyang Choden. According to their application, the land was granted under the Kasho by the 4th Druk Gyalpo to their father for residential use. In the new classification, the land has been categorized under E2 precinct and they have even constructed a house there. They have requested for the change of precinct from E2 to E4.

**Decision**

The *Tshogde* approved the conversion of precinct from E2 to E4 and the decision will be sent to MoWHS for consideration and approval.

**Action:** SLMS

**Agenda 19. Request for waiving off of late fee penalty.**

The request was made by Mr. Karma Chopel to consider and waive off the late fee penalty for land tax, vide *Thram* 1275 at Taba. He stated that he has gone for studies and could not update the land taxed for the years 2013, 2014 and 2015.

**Discussion**

The total penalty for three years comes to around Nu. 12,745. The members felt that the penalty amount is not a big amount to be considered by the Tshogde. Such precedence should not be set. The members even felt that such issues should not be brought up to *Tshogde* as the penalty amount is payable and the concerned officials of *Thromde* should have made sure that the amount is paid without referring to the Tshogde.

**Decision**

The *Tshogde* after voting among the members decided that the penalty has to be paid. The request was not approved.

**Action:** Revenue Section, AFD

### Agenda 20. Endorsement of additional budget for Low income housing

The low income housing project engineer presented to the *Tshogde* the need for additional budget for the completion of the ongoing 16 units, 2 block low income housing in Changangkha. The total expenditure so far is Nu. 8,326,746.00. The *Tshogde* has allocated an initial budget of Nu. 7.5M from the *Thromde's* reserve fund and the amount is inadequate to meet the required expenditure. Therefore, the management has requested for an additional amount of Nu. 1.5M for the completion of the project. The project will have to be completed by March 2016 however the management has requested for a time extension till 1st week of May 2016 to complete it. The total expenditure is estimated to be over 9.00M.

#### Discussion

The members questioned on the progress of the project. The project management informed that all works including the internal and cleaning works will be completed by the 1st week of May 2016. Since it is the project initiated by *Thromde* and endorsed by *Tshogde*, many members shared the positive views. The Chairperson informed that once completed, the house will be given to City laborers after consecration.

#### Decision

The *Tshogde* approved the additional amount of Nu. 1.5M to be paid from *Thromde's* reserve fund.

**Action:** DCFO for payment and LIH project unit

### Agenda 21. Approval for honorarium for VP of MHSS

The TEO explained to the *Tshogde* the need for the payment of honorarium for the Vice Principal (VP) of Motithang Higher Secondary School (MHSS) for having rendered services in School during winter vacation, January 1<sup>st</sup> to 31<sup>st</sup> 2016. He also informed that there have been such cases in the past and the payment has been made. The honorarium is one month's basic pay and the budget is to be used from *Thromde* Education, Higher Secondary budget.

#### Discussion

The members supported since he/she has worked when others were on holidays. If there is a budget in *Thromde* Education, Higher Secondary budget, the request can be granted. DCFO informed that there should be proper documentation like office order. TEO informed that since the principal was out before winter vacation, the office order could not be produced and was little late to process.

**Decision**

*Tshogde* approved the payment of honorarium to VP of MHSS however, there should be proper documentation for such cases before the payment has been made in future and no payment shall be made if there are no proper documentations.

**Action:** DCFO and TEO

**Agenda 22. Study tour for Gold medalist**

It was a proposal from DCFO to the *Tshogde* for approval of study tour for those officials who are recipients of the Gold Medal, which means who have served more than 30 years. He proposed that, these officials can be sent abroad for having served well for more than 30 years. He also informed that, there is a budget balance of 0.44M for ex-country training and 4.00M for in country training from the current FY. The expenditure can be made from this budget balance.

**Discussion**

The member secretary said that there should be proper selection procedures. The members expressed that such opportunities are necessary but there are also chances where newly transferred officials from other agencies might get a chance to go out without having served for a year in *Thromde*. Therefore, there should be certain criteria like the officials will have to serve at least 10 years in *Thromde* or more. Many other members pointed out the need to have certain criteria for selection for such opportunities.

**Decision**

The *Tshogde* after much deliberation decided that the case will be discussed and approve based on the performances and *Tshogde* did not approve the proposal.

**Action:** Management and HRC

**Agenda 23. Final payment to Thai-Company for crematorium**

The total charge for the transportation of crematorium equipment from Thailand to Kolkata was USD 19000 for two containers. But it was found out that the equipment were able to transfer in one container and the charge they requested was USD 15000 which is more than a charge for one container with more justifications, so the payment was approved based on their justifications. The other thing is 3% TDS deduction from the lost money of USD 85500. They have requested not to deduct 3% TDS on the lost money which is around Nu. 170000

**Discussion**

The members expressed that the money has been lost due to hacking and the Company did not receive the money. However, the Tshogde does not have the authority to waive off the TDS and should be processed with MoF.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided that the case will be referred to MoF to seek approval and further directives since it is the tax related issue.

**Action:** DCFO

### **Agenda 24. Outstanding issues against the advances of *Chorten* renovations**

The DCFO presented to the *Tshogde* the outstanding bills of Nu. 0.4M for *Chorten* renovations in Hejo and Jungzhina areas.

### **Discussion**

The works for 0.2M have been completed and it can be settled after endorsing by the renovations committee. The members agreed that the bills can be endorsed by the committee who are involved in the *Chorten* renovations. The bills after endorsing by the committee should be submitted to the Accounts. The remaining 0.2M work is on-going and it can be cleared once the works have been completed.

### **Decision**

The already completed 0.2M should be cleared once the bills have been endorsed by the committee. The remaining 0.2M will be settled once the works have been completed.

**Action:** DCFO and Jungzhina *Thuemi*

### **Agenda 25. Parking related issues**

The road section presented to the *Tshogde* some of the new parking spaces to be developed within *Thromde* areas.

### **Discussion**

The chairperson informed that parking will be a huge problem in future if *Thromde* doesn't come up with proper rules and regulations due to increasing number of cars within *Thromde*. The parking along the roadsides will be prohibited to ease traffic flow. All spaces within *Thromde* which can be developed into parking spaces will be developed into parking spaces and start collection of parking fees. These parking areas will be marked well and it will not be allowed along roadsides. The Road Sections informed *Tshogde* some of the new parking spaces to be developed within *Thromde*:

- a) Above Sangay Enterprise opposite to MoEA -27 Slots (approx.)
- b) Newly Developed parking by BPC below Hotel Taj Tashi -54 slots

- c) In front of My Mart (City Mall) -10 slots (approx.)
- d) Start collection of parking fees within Mothithang & Changzamtog (to be worked out after studying the feasibility)

About 30 spaces out of 54 will be provided for BPC with free parking card as the parking spaces there have been developed by BPC. Even the members supported the view of collecting parking fees and prevent people from parking along the roadsides and preventing smooth traffic flow. Some members raised the issue of parking space standards. The road section informed that the current parking spaces of 2.5 meter are based on the international standards. The members also raised issue with regard to number of years; the BPC will be allowed to have 30 parking spaces. If other agencies develop the parking spaces themselves, will they be allowed too. The Chairperson informed that the certain timeframe will have to be fixed for BPC to use the free parking spaces according to the investment incurred.

The Road section also proposed the closure of Norzin Lam once every month on the first Sunday. Once the MLCPs have been completed, the Norzin Lam will be completely closed for traffic. Therefore, to make people accustomed to the idea, it will be carried out starting June 2016. The road section informed that if the parking closure is approved, *Thromde* will have to compensate KCR for a day that will come to around Nu. 3.12M a year.

### **Decision**

The 30 parking spaces will be provided to BPC defining certain number of years calculated based on the amount of expenditure incurred. "No Parking" sign to be installed in all no parking areas. *Thuemis* will have to inform the public on the importance of having their own parking spaces in their private land. *Tshogde* also decided that starting June 2016, the first Sunday every month will be closed for traffic in Norzin Lam. *Thromde* will compensate KCR.

**Action:** Parking In-charge, Road section

### **Agenda 26. Delegating cleaning service to youth social service group**

The Chairperson informed that a group of 18 youths has approached *Thromde* that they will carry out the cleaning works within *Thromde*. The Environment Division presented the cost break ups of the youth initiative.

Drainage cleaning	- Nu. 55,000
Road cleaning	-Nu. 45,000
Cleaning of Garbage	- Nu. 35,000
Gardening	-Nu. 25,000
<b>Total amount per month</b>	<b>-Nu. 120,000</b>

The detail scenario of total cost, number of workers and total area covered by each laborers group in cleaning the areas within *Thromde* are as shown below:

<b>Detail break up of existing payments</b>							
<b>Group</b>	<b>Cost/ month</b>	<b>Cost/ day</b>	<b>Total length</b>	<b>Person</b>	<b>M/D/P</b>	<b>Cost/meter</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
Contract	255000	8500	40000	40	1012	4.705882353	OFF (Semtokha-Olal ha areas)
D-T package	51600	1720	11992	8	1499	6.972093023	North part A
Tokala	54870	1829	10774	9	1266	5.890650629	North part B
Kafley	115020	3834	14000	18	785	3.651538863	Core area
Kesang	112920	3764	22920	18	1309	6.089266738	Existing
Abi Chandra	<b>203220</b>	<b>6774</b>	<b>22920</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>727</b>	<b>3.383525244</b>	<b>Earlier</b>
C.Gurung	203220	6774	119000	32	3777	17.56716859	Existing
YSS proposal	120000	4000	22920	19	1232	5.73	Proposed

Existing M/R cost per day for sweeping= 26257.00

Existing M/R cost per year for sweeping= 787710.00      New      120000

Existing M/R cost per month for sweeping= 9,452,520.00      New      3600000      13,052,520.00

### Discussion

The members discussed that at first, *Thromde* officials along with the laborers will have to work together with the YSS and from next day the area can be given to YSS. Proper terms and conditions will have to be made. The areas between *Doebum Lam* and above, YHS and below, till Chubachhu and YDF to south could be given to the YSS. The area within this boundary should be looked after by the YSS. It is their responsibility to maintain cleanliness in this area. However, a proper terms and conditions will have to be made.

### Decision

The members supported the idea but also requested if *Thromde* could go on as a pilot basis. Members also requested if there are other youth groups who would also take up same task in other *Thromde* areas. Some of the members also shared their reluctance to agree on such proposal because there are cases where some of such youth initiatives have failed in the past. However, the Chairperson informed that it will be a pilot project and moreover clear terms and conditions will have to be laid.

### **Decision**

The cleaning services within the boundary of MHHS and below, Doebum Lam and above, Chhubachhu and below and YDF and above will be given to YSS as a pilot project. The cost of 120,000 will be reviewed and will have to negotiate with YSS. During the handing over of the area, mass cleaning will have to be carried out involving all *Thromde* staffs and *Thuemis*. The area will be given once proper terms and conditions have been drawn.

**Action:** Environment Division

### **Agenda 27. Report on list of offences and penalties for waste management**

The Environment Division presented to the *Tshogde* the status of offences of waste related issues. From November 2015 till April 2016, a total of Nu. 127,600 have been paid to *Thromde* out of total penalty of Nu. 305800 levied.

### **Discussion**

The Environment Division also proposed to form a committee to review the list of pending cases of the offences which are due for payment. Since the amount is auditable in the future, it will have to be collected even by forwarding it to court. The members were of the view that those pending cases can be forwarded to the court once it has been compile with pictorial evidences.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided that those pending cases will be forwarded to the court after compiling all information with valid evidences. Regarding the committee to be formed, *Tshogde* decided that concerned area *Thuemi*, one from Environment and Internal Auditor can be the committee to verify the waste water and other related issues.

**Action:** Environment Division

### **Agenda 28. Waste to Energy Project – BIOGAS**

The issue is, with more degradable waste going to the only Serbithang compost plant, there have been problems in converting all into manure. This has created problems in the settlements there. The Environment Division presented the Bio-Gas project proposal which would utilize large amount of degradable wastes within *Thromde* to convert into some useful products. The amount of compost manure going to Serbithang has increased after outsourcing the waste collection and

source segregation. In 2015, about 10 tons (1000 bags) of manure has been produced. To solve the problem of excess compost waste, a Bio-Gas project proposal which has the capacity of 10 tons of compost waste consisting of kitchen wastes and human wastes has been explored. The main objective of the project is to substitute LPG and produce organic fertilizer as a byproduct and most importantly to reduce the compost wastes. The mode of implementation of the project could be on a cost sharing basis or on a full financing by *Thromde*. *Thromde* will have to provide free raw materials and 4000 sq. m land. The Company responsible will carry out the free conversion of diesel to CNG for waste collection vehicles. The total cost for the project is 30M and the project will be operational 5 months after the signing of an agreement. So the *Tshogde* will have to decide whether it could be on a cost sharing basis or on a full financing by *Thromde*.

### **Discussion**

Some of the members felt that it can be an investment for *Thromde* if the project really works besides decreasing the degradable wastes. Since such kind of project is first of its kind in *Thromde*, the success of project is questionable.

### **Decision**

Since the project is first of its kind in *Thromde*, *Tshogde* decided to refer the proposal to the Government. A committee constituting of Environment Division, one Engineer and Babesa *Thuemi* to discuss the proposal with the MoEA.

**Action:** Environment Division

### **Agenda 29. Chadri payments made from *Thromde* revenue**

The DCFO informed to the *Tshogde* that a total of Nu. 7.6M has been utilized from *Thromde* revenue for the Chadri expenses.

### **Decision**

*Tshogde* decided to submit the expenses to MoF for reimbursement.

**Action:** DCFO

### **Agenda 30. Dog Management within *Thromde***

The issue was brought up by Motithang *Thuemi* regarding the nuisance created by the pets as well as the stray dogs fed by the people. Raising of pet dogs and feeding of street dogs have created problems for the people passing by in the community. Therefore, some proper regulations will have to be in place to curb such problems.

### **Decision**

The *Tshogde* decided to form a committee involving Environment Division, Changangkha *Thuemi* and Motithang *Thuemi* and the committee will be responsible to discuss the existing rules and regulations if any with DoL regarding the dogs and present it to 3<sup>rd</sup> *Tshogde*.

**Action:** Environment Division to lead

### Agenda 31. Crematorium Management

The issue was raised by Jungzhina *Thuemi*. At the crematorium all kinds of wastes have been dumped into the Wangchu River and have created river pollution. Since the water passes through Linkana Palace below, the throwing of wastes into the river should be stopped with *Thromde*'s intervention.

#### Discussion

All members felt the need to look into the matter as people have been throwing all kinds of wastes into the river along with the ashes. Many members put forth the idea of shifting the crematorium if possible to other locations downstream or to institute some kind of mechanism to prevent the water pollution. Some members said that the point for throwing ashes can be shifted downstream. However, some members said that there are people who face difficulty in getting the transportation and if the point of throwing ashes is shifted far from crematorium, it will be difficult for those people. Some members pointed out that keeping a dustbin nearby along with a sign board could solve the problems.

#### Decision

*Tshogde* decided to install dustbins and all wastes except the ashes must be thrown into the dustbin. A proper sign board stating the clear directives will have to be installed and for 1-2 months, a representative of *Thromde* will have to be at the site explaining the people, not to throw all wastes into the river.

**Action:** Environment Division

### Agenda 32. Population and Hosing Census of Bhutan (PHCB)

The PHCB 2016 will be carried out on 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> May 2016 and *Tshogde* ordered all *Thuemis* and staffs of *Thromde* to render full support to the team conducting the census. Since the event is of National importance, all people under each *Thuemi* will have to render full support to the working team. The PHCB will be conducted for two days.

**Action:** All *Thuemis*

## AOB

### 1) North Thimphu waste outsourcing

The charge for the waste collection is Nu. 435,000 per month. A total of 5 garbage trucks will be given to the contractor and all areas to be served 3 times a week. Source segregation will be carried out as it has been a practice in the areas catered by Greener Way. As per the contract terms the contractor is required to pay a performance guaranteed sum of Nu 2.6M but the contractor has appealed Thromde for not being able to pay the sum since the workers are fresh and young and are all unemployed youths. The contractor has requested the Thromde to reduce the sum and to allow them to pay yearly.

### Discussion

The environment Division has informed the floor that this youth group is also involved in cleaning service in JICA areas and in Changjiji housing colony. Some of the members said that the performance of the contractor has to be monitored and based on their performances; the performance guaranteed amount can be decided. The members also discussed that if it is considered for 3 years, the contractor will have to pay more than 1.5M as a performance guarantee. The members were of the view that if the amount is being decreased, it is auditable and the works will be deleted if the amount is kept as it is since the contractor won't be able to pay. The members said the contractor could be contacted if they are able to pay the amount for 3 years.

### Decision

Tshogde decided for 3 years based on the fact that the people involved in the contract works are all unemployed youths and have got no other sources of income. Once the performance guarantee has been deposited, the works have to be initiated immediately after having drawn the agreement and the same has to be broadcast through media. They will also have to create awareness amongst the people.

**Action:** Environment Division

### Conclusion

The 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde Tshogde* of 2<sup>nd</sup> *Thromde* Council of Thimphu *Thromde* concluded successfully after having passed around 32 decisions to be implemented. The Chairperson thanked all the *Thuemis* and *Thromde* officials for active participation and for having successfully passed various decisions. The *Tshogde* adjourned at 6:00PM. The tentative date for 3<sup>rd</sup> *Tshogde* is on 29<sup>th</sup> June 2016.

**Minute Keeper** – Karma Dorji, Planning Officer